Racism among the Well-Intentioned:
Implicit Bias and Implications for Provider-Patient Interaction

VA Equity Research Conference
September 13, 2010
J. Dovidio
Yale University
Presidential Vote

Percent

'58 '61 '64 '67 '70 '73 '76 '79 '82 '85 '88 '91 '94 '96
Disparities in Health Care: Outcomes (Beyond Access; Penner et al., 2010)

- Coronary heart disease: See specialist, prescribed medications, surgical procedures (Vaccarino et al., 2005)
- Prostate cancer: Screening and active treatment (Etzioni et al., 2002; Shavers et al., 2004; Underwood et al., 2004)
- Esophageal cancer: See surgeon, surgical procedures (Steyerberg et al., 2005)
- Greater for “high discretion” than for “low discretion” procedures (Geiger, 2003)
Factors Contributing to Bias

- Cognitive
  - social categorization
- Motivational
  - social dominance
- Sociocultural
  - cultural stereotypes
Outomes: Subtle Bias

Expressed Behavior

Positive

Negative

Clear

Unclear

White Person

Black Person
Personnel Decisions

Recommendations

- Strong Qualifications
- Moderate Qualifications

1989
- Black Candidate: 8
- White Candidate: 7

1999
- Black Candidate: 7
- White Candidate: 6

2005
- Black Candidate: 8
- White Candidate: 6
Interaction, Subtle Bias, and Intergroup Relations: The Role of Explicit and Implicit Attitudes

- **Explicit Attitudes**
  - Conscious
  - Deliberative
  - Social and Personal Values
  - Self-Report

- **Implicit Attitudes**
  - Unconscious
  - Spontaneous
  - Habit from Direct & Vicarious Experience
  - Response Latency (IAT: https://harvard.implicit.edu)
## Dissociation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Implicit Prejudice Measure</th>
<th>Explicit Prejudice Measure</th>
<th>Statistic (df, n, direction)</th>
<th>Effect size (r)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dasgupta et al. (1999)</td>
<td>IAT using names and pictures</td>
<td>Overall effect</td>
<td>r(73)=.145</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Feelings thermometer</td>
<td>r(73)=.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Semantic differential</td>
<td>r(73)=.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modern Racism</td>
<td>r(73)=-.055</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Diversity scale</td>
<td>r(73)=.06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Discrimination scale</td>
<td>r(73)=.045</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dovidio et al. (1997, study 1)</td>
<td>Evaluative race priming (Black vs. White faces; positive vs. negative adjectives)</td>
<td>Overall effect</td>
<td>r(22)=.215</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Attitudes Toward Blacks</td>
<td>r(22)=.28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modern racism Scale</td>
<td>r(22)=.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dovidio et al. (1997, study 3)</td>
<td>Evaluative race priming (Black vs. White faces; positive vs. negative adjectives)</td>
<td>Overall effect</td>
<td>r(31)=-.03</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modern Racism Scale</td>
<td>r(31)=.01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Old Fashioned Racism</td>
<td>r(31)=-.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fazio et al. (1995, study 1)</td>
<td>Evaluative race priming (Black vs. White faces; positive vs. negative adjectives)</td>
<td>Modern Racism Scale</td>
<td>r(51)=.15</td>
<td>-0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(53) {-}</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fazio et al. (1995, study 2)</td>
<td>Evaluative race priming (Black vs. White faces; positive vs. negative adjectives)</td>
<td>Modern Racism Scale</td>
<td>r(47)=.28</td>
<td>-0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(49) {-}</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Influence of Implicit and Explicit Attitudes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explicit</th>
<th>Implicit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deliberative</td>
<td>&quot;Reflexive&quot; Unaware Uncontrollable Subtle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective Monitorable Controllable Overt</td>
<td>Uncontrollable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Behavior**
Implicit Bias and Hiring
(Son Hing et al., 2008)

Qualifications

Hiring Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strong (No Excuse)</th>
<th>Moderate (Excuse)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Beta = -.04
p = .82

Beta = -.60
p = .003
Subtle Bias and Health Care
(Green et al., 2007, JGIM)

- Vignette study of physicians’ treatment (thrombolysis) of Black and White patients with symptoms of acute coronary syndrome.
- Assessed physicians’ explicit and implicit attitudes and stereotypes (patient cooperativeness) and treatment (thrombolysis)
Green et al. (2007, JGIM)

Explicit Biases (Not Significant)

Implicit Biases (Significant)

Treatment Bias

Not Significant

Significant
How friendly did I behave?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behavior Type</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conscious attitude</td>
<td>.33*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal behavior</td>
<td>.36*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implicit Attitude</td>
<td>.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonverbal Behavior</td>
<td>-.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How friendly did The White person behave?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behavior Type</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conscious attitude</td>
<td>-.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal behavior</td>
<td>-.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implicit Attitude</td>
<td>.40*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonverbal Behavior</td>
<td>.34*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Disparities in Health Care: Interaction (Beyond Access)

- Race-discordant visits are shorter, involve less positive affect, and are less participatory (Albrecht et al., 2003; Cooper et al., 2003)
- 57% of Blacks say that discrimination occurs “often” or “very often” in interactions with White physicians (Malat & Hamilton, 2006)
- Blacks show lower levels of trust of their physician, and more after visit (Gordon et al., 2006; Halbert et al., 2006)
- Participation and trust related to patient satisfaction, seeking treatment, and adherence (Roter et al., 1997; Stewart, 2000)
Physician-Patient Interaction
(Penner, Dovidio, et al., 2010)

• From the Doctor’s Perspective: How much did I try to involve the patient in decision making?

  Doctor’s explicit but not implicit bias

• From the Patient’s Perspective: How warm and friendly was the doctor?

  Doctor’s implicit but not explicit bias
Physician-Patient Interaction
(Penner, Dovidio, et al., 2010)
Challenge: Eliminating Disparities

- Acknowledge the Role of Provider Bias
- Understand the Influence of Unconscious Bias
- Reduce Contextual Factors that Reduce Control (fatigue, cognitive demand, unfamiliarity)
- Don’t Suppress, Create Alternative “Frames”
- Help Good Intentions Translate into Positive Action
Thank You
Race & Trust

- 69% of Whites see racial equality; 59% of Blacks see inequality
- 71% of Whites satisfied with ways Blacks are treated; 68% of Blacks are dissatisfied
- Blacks are more likely than Whites to believe in conspiracies:
  - Government makes sure drugs are available to Black children (60% vs. 16%)
  - AIDS was created in a lab deliberately to infect Black people (19% vs. 5%)